

**MONTEREY BAY NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
ADVISORY COUNCIL
FINAL Meeting Minutes
December 12, 2014
Hilltop Park Center, Monterey, CA**

Agriculture: Kirk Schmidt	CA State Parks: absent
AMBAG: absent	Conservation: Geoff Shester
At Large: Margaret “PJ” Webb	Diving: Brian Nelson
At Large: Dan Haifley	Education: absent
At Large: James Panetta	Commercial Fishing: Kathy Fosmark
Business & Industry: Jessica Grigsby	Harbors: absent
CA Coastal Commission: absent	Recreation: Gary Pezzi
CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife: Paul Reilly	Recreational Fishing: Rich Hughett
CA EPA: absent	Research: Dr. James Lindholm
CA Resources Agency: Cyndi Dawson	Tourism: Mike Bekker

The following non-voting members were present as indicated:

Paul Michel – Monterey Bay NMS
Dr. Steven Lindley – NMFS
LMR Officer Amanda Faulkner – US Coast Guard

Alternates present in audience:

Captain Jim Moser – Commercial Fishing
Dawn Hayes – Monterey Bay NMS
Cynthia Matthews – Citizen-At-Large
Tucker Hirsch – Citizen-At-Large

I. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND MEETING MINUTES

Call to order at: 9:06AM

Paul introduced the new Advisory Council Coordinator, Erin Ovalle, to the council.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

Edits suggested by Deb Wilson-Vandenberg and Steve Scheiblauber.

Approval of Oct 24, 2014 Draft Meeting Minutes

MOTION: Dan Haifley made motion, Rich Hughett seconded.

MOTION: (passed)

(Vote: 11 in favor, 0 opposed, 2 abstentions)

II. STANDING ITEM: SUPERINTENDENT’S REPORT

Paul Michel highlighted a few sanctuary events/issues that have occurred in the past two months. First, Paul met with Tom Raftican and discussed preplanning for the 2015 Sanctuary Classic. This is a summer-long fishing and photo contest featuring national marine. Out of the eight student scholarships awarded last year, one of the winners was a student from Monterey. On November 4th, the outreach event at the Sanctuary Exploration Center had a successful turnout

and was a great opportunity to partner with local businesses in the recreation and tourism sector. Paul attended the Monterey Bay International Trade Association meeting on December 3rd. MBITA has been going through a branding effort in Monterey Bay to boost the idea of Monterey as a super economic region. Presentations are available on the MBITA website (<http://www.mbita.org/>). Earlier this month MBNMS staff attended the CA State MPA collaborative initiative meeting in Sacramento. There are 14 MPA collaboratives, which are forums for dialog and action about education/outreach, enforcement, research and monitoring in state MPAs. Some have received small amounts of funding for specific projects. MBNMS issued a letter of authorization this week for the California Coastal Commission's coastal development permit. This allows CalAm to test the viability of drawing from the aquifer. Test wells are near the CEMEX plant in Marina, CA. CalAm is drilling below the seabed, and construction is currently underway. There will be a need to do a follow-up action to authorize the discharge through the regional sewer outfall. The science team has been preparing for a 9-10 day mission at sea aboard the NOAA research vessel, *Schimada*, taking place in May 2015. The team will be going out to the Davidson Seamount to conduct research on the seamount itself, at mid water and at the surface. There will be a lot of outreach and media efforts to spread the word of this mission. Recruitment for vacancies on the council is currently open for the education primary and conservation alternate seats. The announcement and applications for these vacancies were sent out and are available on the Sanctuary [website](#).

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Questions were raised regarding the Coastal Development Permit and Davidson Seamount mission. One question surrounded how deep the Sanctuary's legal purview goes into the Earth. Paul stated that the Sanctuary's jurisdiction goes below and through the seabed. For more information on the CalAm project and how the Sanctuary weighed in, contact Bridget Hoover, Water Quality Protection Program Director for MBNMS. Members also wanted to know if there were any other agencies collaborating on the Davidson Seamount mission, besides NOAA. Paul stated that partnerships are being formed right now. For more information, contact Andrew DeVogelaere, the mission's Principal Investigator.

III. PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

There were no public comments.

IV. ACTION ITEM: SAC CALENDAR FOR 2015

Paul Michel proposed the [2015 Advisory Council Calendar](#). He pointed out there will be a total of six meetings next year. The February 20th meeting will likely be in Watsonville/Salinas. Topics include the revised introduced species rule, the revised charter, an AQWA update, and a presentation on the Conservation Working Group work plan. April 17th will be in Santa Cruz and include updates from the SEC, updates from all volunteer and citizen science programs, and an update on the condition report, a precursor to the management plan update. On June 19th, a large focus will be on the management plan. The goals of that meeting are to revisit what is in the plan, learn the status of each action plan and prioritize the actions. On August 19th, the joint meeting with GFNMS will take place and will most likely be in Half Moon Bay. Topics for that meeting are being developed. On October 23rd, the meeting will be in Cambria, and include a Coastal Discovery Center update as well as presentations on southern region issues. The December 11th meeting will be in Monterey and will focus on the 2016 Advisory Council Calendar as well as continue with management plan updates.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Members suggested additional meeting topics including a detailed update on recreation and tourism and how it relates to community involvement. It was asked whether or not there will be management plan “homework” for working groups to complete before the June meeting. Paul clarified that he is working on a master plan schedule for all working groups involving specific requests related to the management plan. This will be made available as soon as possible. Paul also added that he would like there to be approximately five public scoping meetings on the management plan. A communications and outreach effort will take place in conjunction with the management plan update. Since this draft calendar was not provided to members prior to the meeting, PJ Webb, chair, and Paul Michel, superintendent, decided not to take a vote on the 2015 Advisory Council Calendar. Instead this was used as a brainstorming session to flesh out meeting topics. It will be provided to Advisory Council members after the meeting, and open for edits.

Approval of 2015 Advisory Council Calendar

MOTION: none

V. INFORMATION ITEM: SAC CHARTER REVISION

Dawn Hayes reported the charter is undergoing further revision and there are five key areas to address. First, edits were made to how the Youth seat is defined and why, with the age range the Advisory Council outlined, this would have to be a college/student seat for individuals attending a college or university. Second, the term limits policy was redefined. It is important to understand the term limit applies to the seat (primary and/or alternate). Third, industry/groups cannot sit in on the selection process of candidates; however they can make recommendations. It is important to keep the language clear not stating a recommendation is mandatory, but is strongly recommended. Fourth, quorum was redefined as being established at the beginning but needed to be maintained throughout the meeting. If a quorum is not present, a vote cannot be made; however the meeting can continue with information items. Headquarters is looking at incorporating the protocols into the same document as the charter. The plan is to submit an extension for the current charter for April, in order to cover any new revisions that could occur between now and December 31st, which is when the charter expires. The charter working group will get back together in mid-January and finalize the draft, and it will come out to the council for review in time for the February Advisory Council meeting. This is only a broad update and the Advisory Council will consider the charter in February.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Members asked questions about the policy regarding industry involvement in the selection process and clarifications on the recruitment process. In regards to the role that industry plays in selecting a new member, Dawn clarified that the working group wanted to ensure that candidates were connected to his/her constituency that he/she is representing. There was a request to get a memo from Headquarters regarding industry or group involvement in order to clear up any confusion. Overall support was shown for combining the charter and protocols into one clear, concise document. In regards to recruitment, Dawn provided a brief outline of the process and noted that a subcommittee from the Advisory Council is chosen and then reviews and comments on applications. Once a candidate is proposed by the Superintendent, Headquarters completes official background checks and the ONMS Director makes the decision. A recruitment subcommittee was established with the following volunteers: Dan Haifley, Jessica Grigsby, PJ

Webb, Brian Nelson, Geoff Shester, Mike Bekker, Cyndi Matthews, and Kathy Fosmark. The review process will begin in January.

VI. INFORMATION ITEM: MARINE BIODIVERSITY OBSERVATORY NETWORK, HOW IT RELATES TO SANCTUARY CONDITION REPORTS AND INTEGRATED ECOSYSTEM ASSESSMENTS

Andrew DeVogelaere reported on the Marine Biodiversity Observatory Network (MBON) and its connection to multiple Sanctuary programs. One of the programs used to monitor the status of different Sanctuary sites is the Sanctuary Integrated Monitoring Network (SIMoN). SIMoN is one of the key programs used to track monitoring efforts within different ecosystems of the region. Historical data are compiled by SIMoN staff and disseminated through the [SIMoN](#) website. Andrew went on to explain Sanctuary condition reports and how they are related to the management plan. Condition reports are structured by 17 different questions organized by habitat type. The MBNMS is broken up into offshore, nearshore, and estuarine sections. In the past, SIMoN data, input from experts, and literature reviews were used to answer the questions. Now, the condition reports will incorporate the Integrated Ecosystem Assessment (IEA) to determine the key parameters to measure to avoid an extensive compilation of data. MBNMS is working with NMFS to develop a way to conceptualize how the habitats are doing within the Sanctuary. The goal is to collect data on the different parameters then select which indicators (i.e. water quality, sea level height, shorebird population, etc.) would be used to help answer a specific question. For example, the question about eutrophication condition in the Elkhorn Slough would require information on nutrient concentrations. In essence, the IEA is going to help focus the process of completing the condition reports. Additionally, the Marine Biodiversity Initiative is going to help in gathering some of those data and make it available instantaneously on the web. Many other partners are involved in this effort such as MBARI, Stanford, and the Southwest Fisheries Science Center. A lot of this work is being developed but all of these groups are determined to successfully answer management questions. For instance, Stanford is interested in analyzing environmental DNA by collecting water samples with the hope of establishing a bank of biological information. In summation, SIMoN tracks monitoring of individual habitats, condition reports use monitoring information and experts to assess ecosystem health, the IEA will help pick the parameters to focus on, and MBON will gather data and present the information in a real-time format so we know more about the status of the Sanctuary.

For more information on the 2009 condition report, follow this link:

<http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/science/condition/mbnms/welcome.html>

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Members asked questions concerning institutional/agency partnerships, involvement with state managed agencies and corresponding funding associated with SIMoN and the Marine Biodiversity Initiative. Andrew clarified some of the institutions involved with SIMoN include other NOAA organizations like the Fleet Numeric Marine and Oceanographic Center and the Naval Postgraduate School. Funds were contributed mostly from NASA, NOAA and several other groups and then dispersed to each institution/research group. Right now, very little state fisheries data are acquired for the Marine Biodiversity Initiative; however Andrew hopes to utilize data sets in the future. Additional questions surrounded the Stanford environmental DNA project and the Davidson Seamount mission. Analyzing environmental DNA would cost considerably less money compared to operating a ROV or sending divers to collect data. Even

though there are some pros and cons, this project has a lot of potential to establish baseline DNA data. The Davidson Seamount mission set for May 2015 will involve oceanographic and mid-water surveys, which have yet to be done. The research team is looking to bring a drone to compare surveys from the ship. The team also plans on bringing in some form of media coverage.

VII. STANDING ITEM: WORKING GROUP UPDATES

Conservation: The Conservation Working Group met earlier this month at Elkhorn Slough. Geoff Shester proposed a draft work plan the CWG members developed at their last meeting. The purpose of developing a new work plan is to help refocus and determine the future direction of the working group. At their last meeting members discussed topics of interest such as whale disentanglement, leatherback sea turtle conservation, alternative energy development, and acoustics/noise. Geoff explained each topic has its own set of objectives and outcomes to fulfill. The idea would be to work on projects deemed of value and help the Sanctuary. Overall, the CWG is asking for approval from the Advisory Council on the draft work plan so it is a proactive effort. The intention is to include the draft work plan as an item on the February agenda so it can be discussed in detail and receive feedback from Advisory Council members.

Education: Paul reported the Monterey Bay Environmental Educators group met with the SEP last month to collaborate and share information. Paul stated the SEP is going to be more actively involved during the management plan update.

Research: James reported the RAP did not have a meeting in November but will meet in January 2015. They have discussed their own work plan and refocusing future projects. The RAP would provide insight to groups needing information rather than pursuing specific topics of interest. James and the RAP are willing to indulge in any interests of the Advisory Council or the Research Team. James is in close contact with Andrew DeVogelaere and the Sanctuary Research Team to figure out future projects.

Recreation and Tourism: Paul and Brian Nelson reported there has been a bit of a hiatus, however the Recreation and Tourism group would like to revive the newsletter to appear more consistently in 2015 to maintain the co-branding effort of the Sanctuary. The purpose is to make the newsletter and all of its information easily accessible for businesses to use. It is also useful for Advisory Council members to connect with their constituencies. Brian stressed the importance of branding through consistency. Ultimately, he would like to get the Recreation and Tourism group back together, formalize meetings, and regularly send out the newsletter because it had received positive feedback in the past.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Council members discussed the CWG's proposed draft work plan and agreed it should be an item on the February meeting agenda. Paul stated this direction of the CWG could help increase the attendance and input from members. Additional input was provided on how to send out the Recreation and Tourism newsletter more often. One suggestion is to send out newsletters seasonally. It may help to work on the majority of projects in winter and have previously made content ready to publicize in the summer.

VIII. ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS/REPORTS

Captain Jim Moser: Even though he is not on the water this time of year, it has been a good crab season so far and the Santa Cruz Harbor held up through the recent storm.

Cynthia Matthews: shared an article appearing in the *Santa Cruz Sentinel* earlier this week. The article focused on a documentary about sustainable seafood along the California coast. The emphasis is on reshaping the way fishermen do business in an era of sustainability. The documentary will be shown on PBS. It is called, "Of the Sea." She reiterated it exhibits a good link between commercial fishing and sustainability.

James Lindholm: The *Sanctuary Currents* Symposium is scheduled for Saturday, April 25th. The call for research posters went out on Tuesday, December, 9th. Dr. Pete Raimondi from UC Santa Cruz is the Ricketts Award speaker this year. The theme centers on citizen science. Posters are due by February 27, 2015. Details for submitting posters are available via the [SIMoN website](#).

Amanda Faulkner: Living Marine Resources Officer USCG reported she is part of the enforcement of Sanctuary regulations in the northern region. She is available to provide information to the Advisory Council on related issues.

Brian Nelson: there has been some success with the *Dive News Network*. They ran an article a few months ago covering Monterey Bay and mentioned the Sanctuary. Brian also provided a *Dive Training* magazine to members reporting on the NMS dive program. In two months, *California Dive News* is going to do a spread on the program as well in order to build brand, similar to what is currently done in dive shops. Crab pot removal funding for next year is underway, funds are continuing to be raised. Help and consideration are appreciated in the grant application process. The Dive newsletter will be out next week.

Dr. Steve Lindley: NMFS is developing outreach material that may be useful to the Sanctuary. This material is about the past, present and future of Chinook salmon in Central California. NMFS is pursuing a Preserve America Grant to support the project, focusing on the Sacramento River area and the fishing industry. A paper by Nathan Mantua and James Johnstone was published in the Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences a couple of months ago that received national and international press attention. With these early, strong rains this year, there has been a strong run of Coho salmon coming into central California.

Jessica Grigsby: highlighted she was involved in the event to celebrate the 50th Anniversary of the Santa Cruz Harbor. Jessica reported it was a well-attended event offering various activities, bringing in crowds of people, which in turn brought businesses. In the future, Jessica would like to coordinate with working groups to implement some of the plans that went into the Santa Cruz Harbor event and hopefully gain similar results.

Geoff Shester: there has been a positive impact on Pacific Herring this season with good spawning events. Additionally, there's been a positive collaboration between the fishing industry, the Department of Fish and Wildlife and the NGO community regarding management of forage fish. A plan is in the works to develop an ecosystem based management plan through

the state of California to be mostly funded by outside sources. There has been some movement in the Pacific Fishery Management Council regarding the finalization of the plan to establish a set of hard caps on the bycatch of certain endangered whales and turtle species that would shut the swordfish drift gillnet fishery down if those caps were exceeded. Final action on that topic is scheduled for March 2015.

Rich Hughett: this has been a strange fishing year coming from a recreational fishing standpoint. Salmon season started and it ended relatively quickly, lasting about two weeks. There are very few sea bass this year compared to previous years. This year has been great for lingcod and crab, creating a lot of excitement in the area. Unfortunately there have been at least three instances where crab poachers have taken crab out of crab pots. Rich commended the Whale Entanglement Team for its efforts in disentangling whales. He is in the process of procuring funds through Fish and Game commissions to support whale disentanglement programs.

Paul Michel: the Sanctuary will participate in the upcoming Whalefest event on Saturday, January 24th on Fisherman's Wharf 10AM-5PM. MBNMS staff has been busy working on exhibit upgrades. They are working with some funds to upgrade current exhibits to determine what resonates with the public and what doesn't.

PJ Webb: Right now elephant seal males are coming on shore, followed by females and a subsequent explosion of tourism. With the boom in tourism, several problems have arisen. First, elephant seals keep going to HWY 1 and popular public beaches, luring many tourists to capture photos/video often in an unsafe proximity to the seals. Second, Pangas are still showing up. The individuals on the last Panga got caught and were arrested on shore. Third, there's been a lot of erosion due to the drought and hikers using non-designated trails. As a result, there's been a loss of vegetation, increased runoff and sedimentation with the recent storms and subsequent erosion. PJ is receiving a lot of constituent input on drones in the Sanctuary, which continues to be a harassment issue for bird habitats. There have been unusual mortality events in the southern region including, fur seal pup strandings, starving California Sea Lions, and large numbers of deceased Grebes. There have been collaborations between CA State Parks, Sanctuary staff and universities to help educate tourists about the wildlife and the dangers of negatively interacting with the animals and their habitat.

Dan Haifley: Next year a campaign to obtain hundreds of acres of public trust land, north of Santa Cruz, will take place. The goal is to obtain national monument status. Land will be set aside for public use (i.e. hiking trails). The Sempervirens fund is leading the effort and there will be an event on February 12th at the Kaiser Permanente arena in Santa Cruz. The acreage is currently called the Coast Dairies Property and the proposed name would be the Santa Cruz National Redwood Monument.

Kirk Schmidt: Surface water toxicity levels in agricultural areas have dropped to the point where the majority of sampling of this water is non-toxic to invertebrates and vertebrates, especially fish. Monterey County is proceeding with a project called, The Tunnel, which would connect Lake Nacimiento with San Antonio reservoirs and increase water management capacity.

Cyndi Dawson: On December 2nd, the Ocean Protection Council met and adopted the California Collaborative Approach, the MPA partnership plan. This document came together over the last year and a half and involved a massive effort amongst state agencies, fishermen, California tribes, and a variety of stakeholders. There are 14 collaboratives running from Del Norte County to San Diego County. They all have leadership in place and each collaborative received a \$10,000 start-up grant to identify a local project. The central focus is to establish an entity that will effectively bring local concerns to the State.

Michael Bekker: a lot of new City Council members have been sworn in and ought to be brought up to speed with Sanctuary news/issues. There have also been issues with drones in highly populated events. These are becoming a nuisance and safety hazard potentially warranting management in the near future. Mike would also like to see outreach/education materials for tourists translated for different languages, such as Chinese.

Gary Pezzi: earlier this month the Santa Cruz chapter of the Surfrider Foundation hosted its annual "Swellebration" to honor past and present volunteers. Next week Moe's Alley of Santa Cruz will be hosting a benefit for the chapter. The event will feature surf music performances by Dick Dale. He attended a meeting on MPWC usage at Maverick's with GFNMS and MBNMS staff, MPWC users and other collaborators, addressing the 27 points of action regarding safe machine usage. In previous meetings this had been a contentious issue; however the committee was able to develop an understanding of proper MPWC usage acceptable by the Sanctuary and surfing community. The hope is to provide an update on this topic in time for the management plan review process.

Paul Reilly: lately from the shores of Carmel to northern Santa Cruz, it's become quite common to see people fishing for surf perch or striped bass. In order to understand and manage the fishery, Paul has been compiling estimates of anglers present on Monterey County beaches from Carmel to the Pajaro River, using instantaneous counts. In past years he has seen an average of 20 anglers on a winter weekend morning; however last Sunday he counted about 90. This surge in angler effort is likely due to better fishing as well as stories that have appeared in local newspapers.

Kathy Fosmark: In addition to the Pacific Fishery Management Council, there are other decision-making bodies such as the Office of Protected Resources and the Take Reduction Team, which determines cap limits of fisheries, not just the swordfish drift gillnet fishery. Kathy noted that protective mechanisms for marine mammals exist and are used by the fisheries. There are important water projects going on associated with the salmon fishery.

Tucker Hirsch: The Monterey Bay Yacht Club hosted the lighted boat parade over a month ago, and was well-attended. This could be a bigger community event next year. There could be increased interaction between the recreational sailors and the commercial and recreational fishermen for this event. This week the Monterey Bay Aquarium is having its Anniversary Free Week for local residents. There is a new top level domain name (ie .com, .gov, .edu) called, ".green." This is a great opportunity for creative marketing for environmentally or ecologically motivated businesses.

IX. INFORMATION ITEM: WHALE ENTANGLEMENT TEAM UPDATE

Public Comment:

Meri Bautch – Marine Life Studies Volunteer

Pieter Folkens talk was very interesting, informative, educational and heartbreaking (for the whales that get entangled).

Pieter Folkens presented on whale entanglement issues, challenges with response to reported sightings of entangled whales, disentanglement permits and how disentanglement works. Pieter is a co-investigator authorized under the Marine Mammal Health and Stranding Response Program permit, the Marine Mammal Protection Act and the Endangered Species Act to engage in whale disentanglement. From 2000-2012, the average number of reports was only eight, but this year that number has more than tripled. Most of the time, fishing and whale watching vessels report entangled whales. Depending on weather conditions, it takes the team an average of two hours to respond to a whale. In cases of bad weather, telemetry buoys are attached to the line and used to relocate the animal. These buoys are critical in finding whales that are hard to reach. A lot of fundraising is needed to acquire more buoys. Pieter hopes that future policy changes can be made to mitigate the amount of abandoned fishing gear that exists and potentially reduce the amount of whale entanglements in the future.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Members asked many questions including how WET is authorized, who Pieter represents, what gear types are most responsible for entanglements, the average response time and the dangers associated with disentanglement. Pieter represents the Alaska Whale Foundation and is authorized under the Marine Mammal Protection Act. He is one of 19 individuals permitted to engage in whale disentanglements. Since the average response time is two hours, having more telemetry buoys could help WET relocate a distressed whale when conditions are hazardous and the team has to leave the whale for a period of time. Pieter reiterated that this is dangerous work and people have died and/or been injured.

X. INFORMATION ITEM: YOUR SANCTUARY TV UPDATE

Steve Ellzey updated members on Your Sanctuary TV projects occurring in the region. Right now efforts are being made to separate Your Sanctuary TV into its own entity, rather than being a Community TV product. Steve went on to clarify some confusion between *Your Sanctuary* and Your Sanctuary TV. *Your Sanctuary* is a television program Steve and Paul Michel produce about Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary. Your Sanctuary TV is a producer, curator, distributor, and marketer of ocean and Great Lakes conservation video content. Materials and videos from Your Sanctuary TV can be found on its website, yoursanctuarytv.org, [YouTube channel](#) and [Facebook page](#). *Your Sanctuary* and various aspects of Your Sanctuary TV have been broadcast on over 350 community television stations nationwide. Steve is currently working with over 120 different YouTube videos, which have received thousands of views from over 170 different countries around the world, especially in the UK and Canada. Steve is working on expanding to different media outlets such as, Instagram and Pinterest. He is also working with NOAA and Oceans Today in order to obtain and assimilate more video content. He would like to connect with corporations in the future to spotlight businesses in the region and potentially develop sponsorships. The main goal is to establish Your Sanctuary TV as its own unit so it doesn't depend on government funding for support.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Members commented on the worth of Your Sanctuary TV and its potential for creating meaningful business partnerships throughout the region. A question was asked about the future of Your Sanctuary TV on Community Television. Your Sanctuary TV is anticipated to have a larger presence on Community Television in the future and hopes to increase the quality of video content. There was a shared interest in doing video collaborations with the working groups to highlight outreach efforts.

XI. ADJOURN

Next meeting on Feb 20th in Watsonville/Salinas

Adjourned at 3:53PM