



# Scoping Input Summary

Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting  
December 11, 2015



NATIONAL MARINE  
SANCTUARIES

---

MONTEREY BAY

# Overview

- Scoping Statistics
- Topical Categories
- Characterized Comments
- Next Steps for MBNMS AC

# Scoping Statistics

- 4 Public scoping meetings
- 220 Comments submitted
- 51 Clear or near duplicates
- 169 Individual comments
- Majority from individuals

# Scoping Statistics

- 7 User group letters
- 6 Conservation group letters
- 6 Government partner letters
- 3 Educational partner letters

# Topical Categories

- 26 Topical categories
  - Topical categories
  - Programmatic categories
- Identified issues, suggested strategies and tools

# Topical Categories

## Collaborative Research & Management

- Artificial reefs
- Beach nourishment
- Birds
- Boundary changes
- Climate change
- Coastal armoring
- Desalination
- Fisheries
  - anchovies
  - fishing in general
- Management Plan Update

# Topical Categories

## **Collaborative Research & Management**

- Marine debris
- Mooring buoys
- Motorized personal watercraft (MPWC)/jet-skis
- Sanctuary Advisory Council (AC)
- Science & monitoring
- Sanctuary Ecological Significant Areas

# Topical Categories

## Collaborative Research & Management

- Water quality protection
  - regional monitoring
  - Runoff
  - miscellaneous
- Wildlife disturbance
  - entanglement
  - harassment
  - soundscape
  - unmanned aircraft systems



# Topical Categories

## **Education, Outreach and Citizen Science**

- Citizen science programming
- Educational programming

## **Regulations**

- Regulatory changes
- Clarifications

# Characterized Comments

## **Artificial reef – Issue identification**

- Requesting artificial reef in MBNMS
- Contributes to local economy
- Attracts wildlife
- Serves as seed site

# Characterized Comments

## **Artificial reef – Issue identification**

- Attract non-local divers
- Reverse/restore damage done by human use
- Reduce pressure on existing sites
- Draws recreational fishermen

# Characterized Comments

## **Artificial reef - Suggested strategies and tools**

- Raise public funds to establish artificial reef
- Divers or boats pay fees to the county to fund
- Divers help financially or by volunteering
- Conduct research on viability and location

# Characterized Comments

## **Artificial reef - Suggested strategies and tools**

- Site artificial reef for no impact to commercial fishing
- Support artificial reefs within MBNMS' management framework
- Permit reef to include enhanced multiple use
- (Dive related) Ensure hyperbaric chamber operations continue

# Characterized Comments

## **Beach nourishment – Issue Identification**

- Severe erosion at Surfer's Beach  
(Half Moon Bay)

# Characterized Comments

## **Beach nourishment – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Continue coordination to find a solution
- Use other sources of clean sand if needed
- Conduct a pilot study on beach
- Restore sediment transport - need permanent location to place sand
- Review historic photos to understand erosion severity

# Characterized Comments

## **Beach nourishment – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Consult Regional Sediment Management Plan for Santa Cruz Littoral Cell
- Revise regs to include beneficial reuse of clean dredged materials to mitigate coastal erosion
- Amend regulations/designation document to allow dredge and disposal of clean, compatible sediments from Pillar Point Harbor



# Characterized Comments

## **Birds - Issue identification**

- Chumming to attract birds for offshore/pelagic bird observations
- Seabird protection from overflights

# Characterized Comments

## **Birds – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Track species of concern (e.g. Ashy Storm-Petrel)
- Monitor persistence of DDT to study effects on California Condors
- Create guidelines for chumming to attract birds
- Change regulation to allow chumming to attract sea birds
- Permit chumming to attract birds (educational)

# Characterized Comments

## **Boundary Changes – Issue Identification**

- San Francisco - Pacifica Exclusion area near San Mateo (“donut hole”)
- Chumash Heritage National Marine Sanctuary (CHNMS)

# Characterized Comments

## **Boundary Changes – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Consider impacts to partners/agencies if boundaries change
- Evaluate marine renewable energy potential and prepare a “Statement of Energy Effects” for any expanded areas
- Include the San Francisco - Pacifica exclusion area to MBNMS or GFNMS
- Expand MBNMS south if CHNMS designation doesn't move forward

# Characterized Comments

## **Climate Change – Issue Identification**

- Climate change (general)
- Ocean acidification
- Sea level rise

# Characterized Comments

## **Climate Change – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Increase coordination and cooperation among science and resource managers to improve planning, monitoring and adaptive management
- Adopt “Greening the Sanctuary” / reduce carbon footprint
- Create a climate action plan with
  - measurable objectives
  - emphasis on outreach/education

# Characterized Comments

## **Climate Change – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Assess other action plans for MBNMS and include climate-related measures
- Prepare better for climate-related coastal hazards (e.g. sea level rise, erosion, etc.)
- Build resilience into coastal communities
- Expand monitoring of ocean acidification

# Characterized Comments

## **Coastal Armoring – Issue Identification**

- Climate-related sea level rise, increased erosion, shoreline loss
- Coastal erosion of hiking trails from increased tourism



# Characterized Comments

## **Coastal Armoring – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Prioritize and use planned (or managed) retreat as a response measure to climate change
- Develop an action plan with specific measures supporting the Coastal Regional Sediment Management Plan
- Increase coordination with other local entities
- Mitigate impacts from increased tourism through outreach/education and coordination with partners

# Characterized Comments

## **Desalination – Issue Identification**

- Drought/water shortage
- Three desalination projects proposed within the sanctuary
- Brine discharge is toxic to marine life
- One or more regional desalination projects are of critical importance to our economy and citizens

# Characterized Comments

## **Desalination – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Update existing action plan
  - improve desalination guidance
  - reflect progress
  - add emphasis on monitoring and enforcement
- Update desalination webpage
- Educate public on environmental impacts to sanctuary

# Characterized Comments

## **Desalination – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Do not permit brine discharge or a desalination plant within the sanctuary
- Permit desalination
- Issue guidelines, regs. or permits balancing environmental concerns with human needs

# Characterized Comments

## **Fisheries (Anchovy) – Issue Identification**

- 99% collapse of anchovy population
- Overfishing of anchovies
- Anchovies not fit for consumption (domoic acid)
- Anchovies are basis of food chain and needed for whales and other marine mammals

# Characterized Comments

## **Fisheries (Anchovy) – Issue Identification**

- Anchovy are important for the sanctuary ecosystem
- Anchovies are ground up for aquaculture
- Lax regulations
- Wasted dead anchovies found floating in the ocean
- Use of 'seal bombs' to scare sea lions

# Characterized Comments

## **Fisheries (Anchovy) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Conduct a new stock assessment
- Update catch limits
- Encourage sustainable harvest
- Enforce stricter limitations
- Ecosystem protection over fishing interests

# Characterized Comments

## **Fisheries (Anchovy) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Make Monterey Bay a true marine protected area
- Monitor the harvest of anchovy
- Consider how anchovy harvest is regulated within MBNMS
- Establish a closer relationship with NMFS
- Pursue the restriction of anchovy harvest by presenting an ecosystem-based perspective to fishery managers
- Halt anchovy fishery



# Characterized Comments

## **Fisheries (general) – Issue Identification**

- Overfishing is a problem
- Reckless overfishing in Monterey Bay must be checked
- Fishermen view MBNMS in negative manner and feel alienated from process

# Characterized Comments

## **Fisheries (general) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Inform the public of the situation
- Halt fishing in the sanctuary
- Only create fishing regulations (or fishing zones) with support from recreational and commercial fishing leaders, if there is support, advise fishery managers

# Characterized Comments

## **Fisheries (general) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Oppose fishermen's request to have approval (veto power) of any fishing rules
- Have Alliance for Communities of Sustainable Fisheries (ACSF) represent fishing interests to MBNMS
- Renew *Fishermen in the Classroom* program

# Characterized Comments

## **Management plan – Issue Identification**

- Revisions are needed
- Limited funding

# Characterized Comments

## **Management plan – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Update fishing practices in management plan
- Update action plan on bottom trawling
- Prioritize number of action plans
  - consider key ecosystem components and stressors
  - create a category of action plans that are addressed only when funding is available

# Characterized Comments

## **Management plan – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Collaborate with partners to implement plans
- Use best available science when developing action plans
- Use peer review or consensus process if conflicts arise about science
- Use community needs to guide revisions of management plan
- Leverage funding and resources with like-minded groups/agencies

# Characterized Comments

## Marine Debris – Issue Identification

- Lost fishing gear
  - fishing line
  - lead weights
  - traps
  - nets
- Plastics

# Characterized Comments

## **Marine Debris – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Support and expand existing discarded or lost fishing gear retrieval programs
- Reduce sources of plastics entering the sanctuary
- Expand beach clean-up efforts
- Maintain and increase education
- Develop a sign for restaurants “straws upon request”



# Characterized Comments

## **Mooring Buoys – Issue Identification**

- Dive community requests placement of moorings at popular dive sites
- Preserves benthic habitat/no hook-ups on kelp or other living organisms
- Less disturbance to wildlife
- Better dive safety (no slipped anchors)

# Characterized Comments

## **Mooring Buoys – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Add a "mooring due" to all boat charters to pay for installation/maintenance of moorings.
- Allow dive community (e.g., dive clubs, diver charter boats) to fund, set and maintain moorings
- Permit the placement of mooring buoys in the sanctuary

# Characterized Comments

## **Motorized Personal WC – Issue Identification**

- Modern MPWC are largely used as personal lifeguards for big wave surfers
- Legal use of MPWCs at Mavericks is unrealistic (27 conditions): mostly a two buddy system
- MPWC use at other high surf locations
- Need areas and opportunity to practice surfer rescue
- MPWC's are a multiple-use and should be allowed

# Characterized Comments

## **Motorized Personal WC – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Conduct an independent peer-review of science justification to ban all vessels (instead of go-slow areas)
- Prioritize training of public safety personnel using MPWC
- Have official on site to monitor activity during all conditions
- Study current MPWC use and the wave conditions in which they are used
- Increase utility and effectiveness of the existing MPWC use zones

# Characterized Comments

## **Motorized Personal WC – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Expand recreational opportunities of MPWC to other locations (practice of rescue methods)
- Allow MPWC use at other selected big wave areas under “large surf warning” conditions
- Allow MPWC use as a safety tool and for increased recreational opportunity
- Amend the MBNMS rule on MPWC use allowing use at Maverick’s in “high surf advisory” conditions

# Characterized Comments

## **Motorized Personal WC – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Review and amend existing rule prohibiting use of MPWC in most of the sanctuary
- Prohibit MPWC use in the sanctuary, except under special circumstances

# Characterized Comments

## **Advisory Council – Issue Identification**

- Sanctuary AC operations
- Business has little representation on Sanctuary AC

# Characterized Comments

## **Advisory Council – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Explore establishing the Sanctuary AC under a local joint-powers authority
- Add a renewable energy industry representative to Sanctuary AC
- Add a tribal representative to Sanctuary AC



# Characterized Comments

## **Science & Monitoring – Issue Identification**

- Better characterization required
- Use Research to inform policy
- Collaboration
- Ecosystem health

# Characterized Comments

## **Science & Monitoring – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Study contribution of MLPA sites to ecosystem health
- Conduct more research to inform policy
- Conduct more characterization, research and monitoring to understand sanctuary ecosystem

# Characterized Comments

## **Science & Monitoring – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Provide funding, ship time, dive services, etc. to science collaborators
- Distribute and stress research on the natural cycles of MBNMS ecosystem
- Study effects of sea lion population on ecosystem

# Characterized Comments

## **Sanctuary Ecologically Significant Areas – Issue Identification**

- Need more information

# Characterized Comments

## **Sanctuary Ecologically Significant Areas – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Conduct more research in SESAs
- Continue following the EFH review process
- Continue collaborative research and pilot management activities with fishermen in SESAs

# Characterized Comments

## **Water Quality Protection (general) – Issue Identification**

- Beach Closure and Contamination Action Plan
- Water quality concerns at San Simeon creek
- Habitat degradation due to excessive pumping (e.g., steelhead)
- Drought
- Fukushima radiation

# Characterized Comments

## **Water Quality Protection (general) – Issue Identification**

- *USS Independence* radiation
- Nuclear dump site by Farallon Islands
- Chemical use to eradicate non-natives
- Industrial agriculture's use of GMOs and toxins

# Characterized Comments

## **Water Quality Protection (general) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Identify focus areas to direct sanctuary resources
- Include Surfrider's volunteer Blue Water Task Force labs into the on-line portal
- Collaborate with local municipalities to ID and fix sources of beach pollution
- Collaborate with other agencies to maintain water quality in local watersheds
- Maintain whole lifecycle of fish



# Characterized Comments

## **Water Quality Protection (general) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Balance and control amount of tourism
- Monitor radiation impacts from 2011 Fukushima accident and share findings
- Monitor radioactive impacts from USS *Independence* and nuclear dump site off of Farallons and share findings

# Characterized Comments

## **Water Quality Protection (general) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Support multi-benefit water supply and conservation projects in local communities (e.g. “Ocean Friendly” gardens)
- Increase public education and outreach with like-minded organizations.
- Limit impairment to watersheds from collection of watershed waters.

# Characterized Comments

## **Water Quality Protection (regional monitoring) – Issue Identification**

- Coordinated regional monitoring program
- Marine species as sentinels for water quality

# Characterized Comments

## **Water Quality Protection (regional monitoring) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Establish coordinated regional monitoring network, building on successful models
- Participate in the Central Coast Regional Water Quality Control Board's efforts to list and remedy Clean Water Act Section 303(d) water bodies
- Incorporate marine species mortalities into regional monitoring reports

# Characterized Comments

## **Water Quality Protection (runoff) – Issue Identification**

- Reduce non-point sources of pollution from landscapes
- Harmful algal blooms (HABs) in the ocean
- HABs occurring within watersheds feeding into sanctuary

# Characterized Comments

## **Water Quality Protection (runoff) –**

### **Suggested strategies & tools**

- Include training and outreach to professional and amateur landscaping/gardening communities
- Conduct trainings re: retrofitting public landscapes for use as best practices demonstration projects

# Characterized Comments

## **Water Quality Protection (runoff) –**

### **Suggested strategies & tools**

- Eliminate fires on beaches
- Encourage beach clean ups after holidays
- Conduct more monitoring of HABs
- Develop better regulations on “Roundup” discharge

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (entanglement) – Issue Identification**

- Whale and turtle entanglement



# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (entanglement) –**

### **Suggested strategies & tools**

- Focus on prevention, response, data collection and collaborative working group
- Increase effectiveness of entanglement response
- Develop best fishing practices to reduce entanglements – ACSF will participate

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (entanglement) –**

### **Suggested strategies & tools**

- Oppose Navy's plan for increasing sonar buoys
- Continue with Pacific leatherback sea turtle as a focal species
- Explore a sister sanctuary program with Indonesia (for leatherbacks)

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (harassment) – Issue Identification**

- Harassment of sea otters, whales, seals, and marine birds by
  - kayakers
  - paddle boarders
  - drones (see Wildlife disturbance: unmanned aircraft system)
  - increased tourism
  - fishermen using bombs and other noise making devices
  - MPWC
  - low overflights
  - Radio-frequency radiation (RF)

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (harassment) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Add more enforcement
- Support funding for enforcement
- Cross deputize enforcement officers
- Initiate a wide-spread public education program using various media
- Support more on-site trained Bay Net and Team OCEAN docents/volunteers
- Support funding for Bay Net and Team OCEAN

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (harassment) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Adopt a kayak company by Bay Net/Team OCEAN volunteers
- Install effective signage
- Develop training videos for kayak/paddle board rental shops
- Identify key areas for nesting, hauling out, mating, and feeding for key species and outline methods reducing disturbance

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (harassment) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Consider alternatives to reduce disturbances while allowing responsible recreational access
- Study impacts from radio frequencies on wildlife, including RF tags, webcams, cell towers, Wi-Fi
- Add Devil's Slide rock to overflight restricted zones
- Add Año Nuevo Island to overflight zones or enforce existing 1000' overflight restriction

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (harassment) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Explore setting a spectator or approach distance from marine mammals
- Raise the approach distance to at least 100 feet (10 kayak lengths)
- Regulate, not just recommend, the distance for approaching marine mammals

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (harassment) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Ban the use of seal bombs by fishermen
- Regulate kayak companies to display their name and identifying number on each kayak



# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (soundscape) – Issue Identification**

- Acoustic impacts to wildlife
- Sonar and electromagnetic field (EMF) testing by Navy and research institutions

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (soundscape) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Coordinate research to better understand the sanctuary soundscape
- Define dangerous levels of high-energy seismic testing
- Participate in the NOAA-level effort to understand soundscapes

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (soundscape) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Study the range of acoustic impacts on MBNMS resources
- Ban all sonar and EMF testing in sanctuary

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (drones) – Issue Identification**

- Drones used in Elkhorn Slough
- Disturbances of seabird colony and marine mammal haul out areas
- Drones are useful for some research projects

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (drones) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Coordinate research to better understand the sanctuary soundscape
- Define dangerous levels of high-energy seismic testing
- Participate in the NOAA-level effort to understand soundscapes

# Characterized Comments

## **Wildlife Disturbance (drones) – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Study the range of acoustic impacts on MBNMS resources
- Ban all sonar and EMF testing in sanctuary

# Characterized Comments

## **Citizen Science – Issue Identification**

- Citizen science needs to be a priority
- Creating more ocean stewardship needs to be a priority
- Invest in future generations of ocean stewards
- Missed opportunities for additional public outreach, involvement and education in the most direct and relevant manner by not having sufficient Bay Net and Team OCEAN volunteers

# Characterized Comments

## **Citizen Science – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Expand partnerships and other external support to ensure continuation of the Bay Net, Team OCEAN and BeachCOMBER programs
- Standardize and merge programs with GFNMS, e.g., Beach COMBERS and Beach Watch
- Expand Bay Net, Team OCEAN with more funding
- Hire a full-time volunteer coordinator



# Characterized Comments

## **Citizen Science – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Develop citizen science programs
- Support LiMPETS in the Cambria area of MBNMS
- Expand NOAA Ocean Guardian School program

# Characterized Comments

## **Education – Issue Identification**

- Need improvements to education and outreach

# Characterized Comments

## **Education – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Develop NOAA branding for Coastal Discovery Center, San Simeon Cove Beach and throughout Cambria and San Simeon.
- Implement live webcams at San Simeon Cove and audio on Friends of the Elephant Seal webcam.
- Improve readability of SIMoN website
- Purchase former Stohan property in Monterey for another visitor center

# Characterized Comments

## **Education – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Provide more support for SEC
- Collaborate with schools to create learning opportunities for elementary thru high school
- Communicate cause and effect of sea star wasting disease

# Characterized Comments

## Regulations – Issue Identification

- Beach nourishment
- Birds
- Boundary change
- Desalination
- Fisheries: anchovy fisheries
- Fisheries: fishing

# Characterized Comments

## Regulations – Issue Identification

- Motorized Personal Watercraft (MPWC)/jet-ski
- Water quality protection: run-off of contaminant
- Wildlife disturbance: harassment
- Wildlife disturbance: soundscape
- Other

# Characterized Comments

## **Regulations – Suggested strategies & tools**

- Clarify the application of MBNMS' regulations on "abandoned" vessels
- Enforcement officers shouldn't be allowed to speed through kelp
- Require boats are cleaned before they are moved to prevent spread of invasive species
- Better regulation/enforcement of the vessel traffic lanes

# Next Steps

## **December 2015 – Feb 2016**

- Staff and AC review comments
- Comments are:
  - incorporated into action plan development
  - tabled or identified as emerging issue
  - not further considered
- Staff prioritize topics requiring working groups
- Staff identify topics for SAC workshops / input
- AC provides input on staff recommendations