

**MONTEREY BAY NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**Final Meeting Minutes
February 21, 2014
Pacific Grove Community Center
Pacific Grove, CA**

The Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS) Advisory Council met on Friday, February 21, in Pacific Grove, California. Public categories and government agencies were present as indicated:

Agriculture: Kirk Schmidt	CA State Parks: absent
AMBAG: Lynn Robinson	Conservation: Geoff Shester
At Large: Margaret "PJ" Webb	Diving: Brian Nelson
At Large: Kortney Opshaug	Education: Simona Bartl
At Large: James Panetta	Commercial Fishing: Kathy Fosmark
Business & Industry: absent	Harbors: Steve Scheiblaue
CA Coastal Commission: Tami Grove	Recreation: Gary Pezzi
CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife: Paul Reilly	Recreational Fishing: Rich Hughett
CA EPA: Maria de la Paz Carpio-Obeso	Research: James Lindholm
CA Resources Agency: Valerie Termini	Tourism: Mike Bekker

The following non-voting members were present as indicated:

Monterey Bay NMS: Paul Michel
Gulf of the Farallones NMS: Max Delaney
Elkhorn Slough NERR: Dave Feliz
National Marine Fisheries Service: Steven Bograd

Alternates present in audience:

Jim Moser – Commercial fishing
Amity Sandage – Education
Kris Beal – Agriculture
Barton Selby – Recreation
Dan Haifley – At Large
Robert Chatham – Recreational Fishing
John Hunt – Research
Bob Massaro – Tourism
Dawn Hayes – Monterey Bay NMS

I. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND MEETING MINUTES

Bill Kamp, Mayor of Pacific Grove, welcomed the council to the City of Pacific Grove. He announced the re-opening of the hyperbaric chamber, a significantly improved resource for divers in the region, and the new harbor seal ordinance (with help from MBNMS and BayNet volunteers) to protect harbor seals during the pupping season.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

Approval of December 11, 2013 DRAFT Meeting Minutes
The advisory council approved the December 11, 2013 DRAFT Meeting Minutes.

Brian Nelson introduced a motion to approve the December meeting minutes.

MOTION: Passed

Seconded by Mike Bekker.

(Vote: 17 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstention)

II. STANDING ITEM: Superintendent Report

Paul reported on the sea star wasting disease and the role that Sanctuary staff are playing to help monitor and determine the cause. He also updated the council on two recent successful events: the Water Quality Conference in Watsonville and the 4th Annual WhaleFest in Monterey. Paul passed around a book written by former council member Chet Forest, "Emotion for the Ocean," an ocean education book written for a general audience and added that 100% of the proceeds go to ocean research (available for purchase on Amazon). Paul provided some council updates: the next meeting will be April 25th in Santa Cruz, and the council will be electing a new executive committee, logo wear orders and member recruitment have both been delayed (contact Sara for logowear pick-up) and staff have ordered tables to allow for inclusion of our alternates at future council meetings. Finally, Paul gave an update on the council coordinator coffee talks to better understand council members' perspectives, and announced some general trends Sara has found so far with these meetings.

III. PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Nicholas Naccari (Conservation Working Group member): provide scientific documented evidence of sonar and airgun blasting damage, injury, and mortality to marine mammals.

Rex Keyes (Elkhorn Yacht Club): Mavericks (surfing) and the biodiversity of sea life in Moss Landing.

IV. INFORMATION ITEM: Leatherback Turtle Summit

Simona Bartl and Geoff Shester provided a presentation on the Leatherback Sea Turtle Summit that took place in Monterey in October 2013. Their presentation is available here: http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2014/140221/140221leatherback_ppt.pdf and the facebook page for this project is "Our Shared Leatherback Sea Turtles".

SAC discussion:

Many members expressed how impressive and impactful this effort is, commended the successes, and encouraged continuation of this important international work. James Lindholm commended Simona and Geoff on behalf of the research community for their efforts. There was some discussion regarding how turtles are tracked and counted, threats that are impacting the turtles (many unknown; known threats include poaching, habitat degradation, predation by introduced species, and fisheries), nesting and foraging areas, the degree of outreach to local schools, basic life history of turtles, the use of turtle eggs by Indonesians for food and money, and ship strike impacts on turtles. Member recommendations included increasing effort to also focus on the nesting beaches in Australia, conduct outreach of this information responsibly in the context of impacts from fisheries, consider this effort as a subject of a future *Your Sanctuary* TV show, and to use council members and the community to report back on sightings and spread the word.

PJ Webb introduced a motion for consideration by the council to both commend the efforts of the CWG in this project and to recommend future actions for sanctuary staff to take. Many on the

council expressed general support for the motion, but concern that they were not notified in advance that a motion would be considered at this meeting. Concerns from members included the need to abstain from the vote without the approval of their constituency, staff time and resources to address the motion's recommended actions, and the fishing concern that a motion like this could be used to lobby against the drift gillnet industry. Paul Michel clarified that prior notice of a motion is not needed or required, and that a motion is simply an action reflected in the minutes. These activities will continue regardless of council support, though council support is very valuable to sanctuary staff.

Jimmy Panetta made a motion to table PJ's motion until the April meeting so that members have enough time to consider the motion language. Council members discussed the merits and disadvantages of voting on the motion, and ultimately voted to place this on the agenda for the April meeting.

Jimmy Panetta introduced a motion to postpone PJ's motion to the April meeting.

MOTION: Passed

Seconded by Steve Scheiblaue.

(Vote: 12 in favor, 5 opposed, 0 abstention)

V. STANDING ITEM: Advisory Council Member Announcements

James Lindholm: *Sanctuary Currents* Symposium is April 26 at CSUMB with the topic of marine debris. A call for student research posters is out now.

Valerie Termini: Ocean Protection Council meeting is next Wednesday in Sacramento and will include a discussion of a proposal to provide \$350,000 for MPA signage. The project would develop a list of where signs should go along the California coast and staff expect 90-100 large educational signs and 100 smaller regulatory signs. You can visit the OPC website for more information.

Maria de la Paz Carpio-Obeso: The State Water Resources Control Board Ocean Unit is working on Trash Amendments to the California Ocean Plan that will be released in 3rd week of March for public comment.

Simona Bartl: Moss Landing Marine Labs free Open House is May 3 and 4. The report "Leveraging Ocean Education Opportunities" is available (Simona can send out the link to anyone interested) and is a great resource for justifying ocean science education. Finally, the Sanctuary Education Panel (SEP) is interested in having a youth seat on the council, and would like this to be considered during the charter revision process.

Mike Bekker: Water and drought continue to be the biggest issues for the tourism industry right now; however, tourism is remaining very high with a lot of activity in the area.

Rich Hughett: A fly fishing show is in Pleasanton, you can find information online, and Local Catch Monterey is a great program and all should sign up – they'll soon be expanding to San Jose/SF area.

Paul Reilly: The California Department of Fish and Wildlife and the Fish and Game Commission have closed many coastal streams to fishing to protect salmon due to severe drought and insufficient water flow through March 7 or until stream flow has replenished. All rivers in our area are closed right now to fishing which is unprecedented.

Lynn Robinson: The tourism season has remained very active, with no down time this year. AMBAG's work with the sanctuary and the City of Santa Cruz has been very beneficial – the water quality conference was especially useful for the community.

Kathy Fosmark: The annual fisheries forum by the State Joint Committee on Fisheries and Aquaculture will be April 24, 2014 in Sacramento, and there will be live streaming on the web. The forum will include testimony from all kinds of fishers and the seafood industry, recreational users, etc.

Paul Michel: Sanctuary movie night is April 12 at the Hearst Theater in San Simeon, and May 17 will be the 100 year celebration of the Santa Cruz wharf. June 7 is the *Beneath the Waves* film festival at the Sanctuary Exploration Center.

Kirk Schmidt: There is still great concern over the drought in the agriculture community and a seminar and lunch will be at the Santa Cruz County Fair Grounds in April.

Geoff Shester: The Pacific Fisheries Management Council is considering a proposal to reduce the size of the Leatherback Conservation Area (closure to drift gillnets). Geoff showed images of species caught in drift gillnets off of the California coast and encouraged the support of Assemblybill 2019 by Mark Stone to end the drift gillnet fishery off California.

PJ Webb: Cambria is experiencing a severe water shortage. Rate surcharges are starting at 500% for use in excess of the drought emergency allotment. This drought is putting more pressure on issues like desalination. The Coastal Discovery Center just had a new docent training and the tourism season has been busy all year, which brings increased interactions between people and wildlife, including seal pupping and elephant seals.

Brian Nelson: The February diving newsletter went out; click-throughs are getting a lot of hits, the inclusion of videos has increased readership and they are getting 41% of opens from receivers (nearly triple the industry standard). They are getting feedback that the community would like more communication like this. Brian is more than happy to share the newsletter and the results with the council – he'll add everyone and they can always opt-out. Frank Degnan and CSUMB divers collected nearly 3,000 pounds of trash in 2013 from under water.

Kris Beal: Previously contentious parties (agriculture, residential) have come together for a proposal for a water management agency in the Paso Robles area, which is very unusual but says a lot about people with different perspectives finding common ground to make change. The Food and Wine festival is in April, and may be a good opportunity to include outreach regarding the sanctuary and/or Local Catch Monterey.

Steve Bograd: Attended the water quality conference, great job on organization and speakers. A group of rowers will be paddling from Monterey to Hawaii on June 8, will take about a month. April 18 is the 50th anniversary of Santa Cruz Harbor – events going on for that. Steve expressed appreciation that the Sanctuary is trying to improve relationship with fishers (EFH is an example), so Steve cautioned the council against stepping into a fishery management position, would be a step backwards.

Dave Feliz: Dave will be hearing a sea otter research update next week to learn about otter use of the slough – lots of females and pupping taking place there (estuaries are very important!). The Reserve is finishing a volunteer training to bring on 15 people, also bringing on 2 interns that will do shorebird surveys along Monterey Bay and provide outreach to the Latino community.

Rob Chatham: Rob asked Paul to report on Sanctuary Classic events for this year; Paul reported that it depends on funding, but staff would like to do something, so stay tuned.

Jim Moser: Biggest issues right now for local fishermen are lack of boatyards and lack of water. There has been a good return from hatcheries; the biggest concern is getting salmon fingerlings back down to the ocean. There are some efforts to barge those fish down from the hatcheries and Fish and Wildlife may be blocking this from happening. The Santa Cruz boatyard is closed right now and the Moss Landing boatyard has environmental restrictions. This is a big issue for boat owners, as they need to haul boats out and paint bottoms.

VI. INFORMATION ITEM: Understanding and Reducing the Impacts of Underwater Noise in Marine Protected Areas

Leila Hatch provided a presentation to the council on the known impacts of underwater noise to species in marine protected areas. Her presentation is not available at this time.

Council members discussed how to generalize known impacts and apply that knowledge to other regions, and the need to gather information regarding the noise landscape for particular locations. Council members wanted clarification on who manages noise and who should be involved in this management and protection process. There was discussion regarding the identification of sources of noise that are more harmful than others, and it was acknowledged that a lot is still unknown about all sources and all impacts of noise. The major contributors to the low frequency impacts are fairly well understood, but the specific impacts of those are less known. Council members discussed with Leila the different regulatory mechanisms that can be used for protection, and there was discussion regarding the similarities the sanctuary has with the National Parks Service that may make it possible for resource managers to share tools and resources for increased protection from sound impacts. Finally, the council discussed the need to identify what the “natural” acoustic habitat should be, and what managers should try to restore the soundscape to; Leila responded that the targeted goal should be to reverse the trend of the three decibel noise increase per decade.

LUNCH

VII. STANDING ITEM: GFNMS Superintendent’s Report

Max Delaney provided the report for GFNMS and reported on the permit issued for the Maverick’s surfing competition this year, which ran very smoothly, including the outreach provided by staff during the event. There were five motorized personal watercraft (MPWC) cited for illegal use by the NOAA Office of Law Enforcement, in addition to a marine mammal disturbance event from a low-flying aircraft that is being pursued. Max provided updates on a recently developed Beach Watch report, a Climate Change Indicators Report, and staff participation in the Society of Marine Mammalogy Conference in New Zealand to discuss their work with the shipping industry to limit the incidence of ship strikes to whales. Two upcoming events include a large recruitment of new advisory council members and the Mola Mola Soiree on March 29th. Information on these events is available on the GFNMS website at farallones.noaa.gov.

VIII. STANDING ITEM: Working Group/Subcommittee Updates

Conservation Working Group: The CWG met on February 21st and adopted a schedule for future meetings. They expressed hope that by August the SAC may take some kind of action on the seismic issue, and support for the GFNMS/CBNMS boundary expansion and Assembly Bill 1603. For the full CWG report, please visit the website here: <http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/cwg/2014/140212cwgsumm.pdf>.

Sanctuary Education Panel(SEP): The SEP met in January for a kick-off meeting for the year, and had great turn-out. Paul Michel, sanctuary superintendent, provided an update from the sanctuary and discussed educational priorities for the year (marine debris, ocean acidification, youth involvement). SEP members decided to focus its efforts this year on marine debris. For the full SEP report, please visit the website here: <http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/sep/2014/140116sepsumm.pdf>.

Research Activities Panel (RAP): The RAP met on January 10th to hear presentations on ripple scour habitats and oil spill response, and held discussion on seismic survey issues and the CWG resolution's proposed language. They will be discussing the sea star wasting syndrome at the next RAP meeting, particularly the deep water characterization project that will be using video and stills to investigate a possible depth refuge from the disease. For the full RAP report, please visit the website here: <http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/rap/2014/minutes/011014rapsumm.pdf>.

Recreation and Tourism Working Group: The recreation and tourism working group held its inaugural meeting in February and spent time identifying current activity, connections and influence of group members, and how to leverage members' connections with what the sanctuary is doing. One idea that came out of this meeting is to develop a newsletter, modeled after the diving newsletter that would be aimed at recreation and tourism purveyors and business owners. At their first meeting, the working group also discussed internal organization and decided to focus on building a strong foundation before reaching out.

Motorized Personal Watercraft (MPWC) Subcommittee: The MPWC met in January 2013 to review the MPWC situation, and again in January 2014 with different membership to define the goals of the subcommittee. At this meeting, staff provided a proposal of action to the group for consideration as a way to move forward. The subcommittee met again in February 2014 and decided to focus their efforts on Maverick's and to address surfer safety under current regulations by considering staging MPWCs on boats or on the beach, and by considering a permitted safety rescue group. The subcommittee plans to consult with outside expertise on the feasibility of the proposed approaches.

IX. ACTION ITEM: Letter of Support for Outdoor Environmental Education

Dan Haifley introduced the proposed legislation AB 1603 to establish an outdoor environmental education program through the Parks and Recreation Department and provided justification for action. Outdoor environmental education is generally underfunded, but this type of education is highly valuable to students in our region, especially in underserved populations (science scores were 27% higher for students that participated in outdoor environmental education). Additionally, O'Neill Sea Odyssey found an equalizing effect for under-served students that are involved in their program. This legislation would add a funding source within the Department of Parks and Recreation as a grant program (no specific amount yet) for educational programs that prioritize outreach to underserved populations, have a service learning component, and comply with education standards and common core.

SAC discussion:

The council discussed the appropriate timing of a support letter for this legislation, confirmed with Dan that this legislation has support from the California Department of Parks and Recreation, and expressed the desire for the legislation to allocate a certain amount of this funding to ocean-specific programs (right now, the language is more general). The council discussed the letter and made a few changes to the language. The final letter of support is available here: <http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2014/140221/140221ab1603support.pdf>.

A motion was made by Steve Scheiblauber to approve the letter of support.

Motion: PASSED

Seconded by Jimmy Panetta.

(Vote: 16 in favor, 0 opposed, 2 abstention)

X. INFORMATION ITEM: Update on the MLPA Central Coast Monitoring Effort

Liz Whiteman of the California Ocean Science Trust (OST) provided an update on the MLPA Central Coast Monitoring Effort. Her presentation is available here: http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2014/140221/140221mlpa_ppt.pdf.

SAC Discussion:

The council and presenter discussed the framing of the science questions for the monitoring program, baseline data and metrics used in the program, the prospect for long-term funding, the investment provided to proposed and funded projects, and signage/brochures/navigational aids for the MPAs. Paul Michel expressed the desire to better integrate with sanctuary work and asked how the sanctuary may be able to benefit the process and take advantage of resources that the sanctuary has already created. Liz suggested taking a collective commitment to consistent communication between OST and MBNMS.

XI. ACTION ITEM: Establishment of Charter Revision Subcommittee

Sara Hutto, Advisory Council Coordinator, provided a brief presentation on the timeline and process of revising the council's charter. Her presentation is available here: http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2014/140221/140221charter_ppt.pdf.

A motion was made by Rich Hughett to establish a charter revision subcommittee to help sanctuary staff develop an updated charter.

Motion: PASSED

Seconded by Gary Pezzi.

(Vote: 15 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstention)

The following council members volunteered to serve on the charter revision subcommittee:

Steve Scheiblauber

Brian Nelson

PJ Webb

Rich Hughett

Kirk Schmidt

Lynn Robinson

The council had questions regarding the time commitment, the logistics of meetings, and next steps. Sara will be sending out the needed materials to subcommittee members in the following weeks.

XII. INFORMATION ITEM: MBNMS Vessel Traffic Analysis

Sophie provided a report on vessel use and compliance of the International Maritime Organization recommended tracks that were established in 2000. Her presentation is available at: http://montereybay.noaa.gov/resourcepro/reports/140127mbnms-ais_report.pdf.

SAC discussion:

James Lindholm recommended contextualizing the ramifications of deviating outside the recommended tracks as a way to provide a better idea of what the consequences are for the marine environment. Bart Selby recommended matching the port calls to the AIS data for more insight and details on the ships that are not complying.

Submitted by Sara Hutto, Sanctuary Advisory Council Coordinator
Meeting adjourned at 3:50 pm