

MONTEREY BAY NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY  
ADVISORY COUNCIL

FINAL

Meeting Minutes  
December 4, 1998  
UCSC Arboretum  
Santa Cruz

The Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS) Advisory Council met on Friday, December 4, 1998 at the UC Santa Cruz Arboretum. Public categories and government agencies were present as indicated:

Agriculture: Richard Nutter  
Diving: Ken Lundie

AMBAG: Katherine Beiers  
Education: Dorris Welch

At Large: Steve Webster, Chair  
Enforcement: Doug Huckins

At Large: Karin Strasser Kauffman - ABSENT  
Fishing: Dave Danbom

At Large: Chet Forrest  
Ports & Harbors: Steve Scheiblaue

Business & Industry: Steve Abbott  
Recreation: Sally Smith

CA EPA: Marc Del Piero  
Research: Greg Cailliet

CA Coastal Commission: Lee Otter  
Tourism: Ed Brown

CA Resources Agency: Brian Baird  
U.S. Coast Guard: LCDR Phyllis Blanton - ABSENT

Conservation: Rachel Saunders

The following non-voting members were present as indicated:

Monterey Bay NMS: William Douros  
Gulf of the Farallones NMS and Cordell Bank NMS: Ed Ueber - NOT PRESENT  
Channel Islands NMS: Ed Cassano - NOT PRESENT  
Elkhorn Slough NERR: Becky Christensen

I. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, WELCOMING REMARKS,  
APPROVAL OF OCTOBER 2, 1998 DRAFT MEETING MINUTES,

## REVIEW OF CORRESPONDENCE

### A) Call to Order and Roll Call

The meeting was called to order by the Chair at 9:00 a.m. Ed Brown conducted the roll call - a quorum was present.

### B) Welcoming Remarks

University of California Santa Cruz (UCSC) Chancellor Greenwood welcomed the Advisory Council to UCSC and the Arboretum. She expressed her appreciation for the strong relationship between the Sanctuary and UCSC'S Long Marine Laboratory, and announced that the new Marine Discovery Center will be open sometime between the spring and fall of 1999. Chancellor Greenwood wrapped up her welcoming remarks by providing an overview of the Arboretum.

### C) Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes

The minutes from the October 2, 1998 Advisory Council meeting were approved as amended.

### D) Review of Council Correspondence

The Chair forwarded the sign-up folder for Advisory Council correspondence written since the last Council meeting.

## II. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

There were no comments from the public.

## III. PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION: KELP HARVESTING STUDY AND SIGNED COOPERATIVE

Steve Webster, Chair, introduced the topic of kelp harvesting by explaining that the cities of Monterey and Pacific Grove had joined together with the Sanctuary to fund a study of the impacts of kelp harvesting off Cannery Row. Steve introduced the presenters of the kelp harvesting study, Dr. Michael Foster and Michael Donnellan of Moss Landing Marine Laboratories.

Dr. Foster provided a background on kelp and explained that he has been looking at the question of whether kelp harvesting has important ecological effects. Though harvesting most certainly has some effects, as do other uses, Dr. Foster emphasized that he has been looking for important, ecological impacts. In defining <sup>3</sup>important<sup>2</sup>, Dr. Foster overviewed the life history of giant kelp and past kelp studies. A couple of years ago, Dr. Foster concluded that kelp harvesting did not have important, ecological impacts because:

1. harvesting does not kill the kelp plant - harvesters take the top four feet of the canopy (the canopy is a reflection of the number of fronds, not the number of plants)
2. kelp is enormously productive - 200,000 tons of kelp are produced and leave annually as drift in the Monterey area
3. kelp forests are naturally dynamic - there is a large seasonal variability of kelp canopy cover

According to Dr. Foster, past studies on mechanical kelp harvesting did not find any important ecological impacts, however, the studies did reveal that sometimes invertebrates are incidentally taken, and that entire plants are sometimes pulled up over sandy bottoms. Harvesting off Cannery Row is done by hand, and while invertebrates are sometimes taken incidentally, all species taken are abundant. According to Dr. Foster, some kelp studies have indicated that the trimming of the kelp canopy increases kelp production by increasing light penetration.

According to Dr. Foster, the total harvest of kelp statewide is half what it was during World War I when it was harvested from the holdfast for algin to use in gun powder. Today, 150,000 wet tons are harvested annually statewide.

Dr. Foster introduced Mike Donellan who provided an overview of the Cannery Row kelp harvesting study and its preliminary results. Mr. Donellan is looking at potential long-term effects of hand harvest of the kelp bed canopy off Cannery Row (identified as a portion of Bed #220 which extends from Cypress Point to the Monterey breakwater). Mr. Donellan explained that he used available data including aerial photographs and kelp harvest records since 1987. These data resulted in some constraints due to the irregular aerial photographic records and limited harvest records (records for Bed #220 only since 1987).

Mr. Donnellan used three measurements in his study: canopy area, planimeter area, and relative density index. The relative density index is derived by dividing the measurement of the canopy area by the measurement of the planimeter area. The portion of the kelp bed off Hopkins Marine Station was used as a control site because harvesting is not permitted there. Mr. Donnellan compared three study sites during the late summer and early fall of 1998 to the Hopkins control site. Preliminary results are inconclusive and indicate no detectable effects of kelp harvesting as practiced during the summer and fall. However, the statistical power to detect such an effect was low given the small sample size and high natural variability of kelp.

Discussion ensued among the presenters, Council members, and the public. Topics included:

- ... what the study says and doesn't say
- ... highest intensity of kelp harvesting occurs during the winter months when kelp canopies are at their smallest sizes; the study does seem to assess that period
- ... potential wave dampening effects from cutting the canopy on sea otter habitat and shoreline erosion
- ... need for the continuation of the study
- ... Monterey resolution to set aside a no-kelp harvesting zone
- ... implications of kelp harvesting to other marine life
- ... resource conflict issue between harvesters and tourism industry

Local kelp harvesters presented their newly signed Kelp Harvester's Cooperative. Joe Cavanaugh, Monterey Abalone Company, reviewed the history of the Cooperative and thanked the Sanctuary staff and Steve Scheiblauber for their assistance. He invited the Council to visit their facilities and introduced Art Sevey of Monterey Abalone Company and appointed harvester representative of the Cooperative's Board of Governors. Art reviewed the Cooperative and the Board of Governors, which consists of three representatives - harvester, resource manager, and scientist. The resource management seat has been offered to Jerry Spratt, CDFG. MBNMS will appoint the scientist representative.

Discussion followed regarding:

- ... the possibilities for increasing the area of harvest and potential opportunities for harvest in Stillwater Cove
- ... involvement of other stakeholders in the Cooperative
- ... City of Monterey resolution limiting harvesters off Cannery Row to Monterey-based operations only
- ... potential Half Moon Bay operations and their impacts to Bed #220
- ... designation of an outstanding natural water resources area
- ... kelp monitoring

The harvesters were congratulated by the Council for their accomplishment in establishing the Cooperative.

Greg Cailliet made a motion that the Council recommend to Sanctuary management that they allocate resources to continue the kelp study off Cannery Row. The motion was seconded by Marc Del Piero and passed unanimously.

#### IV. DISCUSSION: LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE

Steve Webster reviewed the purpose and members of the Legislative Task Force and asked for any input from Council members regarding future directions. Suggestions included having the group track implementation of existing legislation and changing the name of the group to Legislation Committee.

#### V. FOLLOW-UP ON PRIOR ITEMS

Lisa de Marignac presented the Advisory Council with the Certificate of Recognition for the Governor's Environmental and Economic Leadership Awards Program which the Advisory Council applied for during the spring of 1998.

Bill Douros updated the Advisory Council on the following items:

... MBNMS Penalty Schedule - As a result of the Advisory Council's letter supporting the MBNMS penalty schedule proposed by the Sanctuary staff, the General Council for Enforcement and Litigation (GCEL) completed the final penalty schedule for MBNMS and sent it to headquarters in Silver Spring.

... Live Fish Fishery - At the request of the Advisory Council at their October 2, 1999 meeting, Bill Douros sent a letter to CDFG requesting that the agency take action to address concerns regarding the commercial live fish fishery. Bill requested that the CDFG dedicate additional personnel and other resources to fully understand ecosystem effects of the live fish fishery, and take appropriate action to properly regulate the fishery.

... Vessel Traffic Safety - Minor revisions to the vessel traffic package were made in response to public comments at previous hearings, and the final document was distributed to the Navigation Safety Advisory Council (NAVSAC), a national industry advisory body to the USCG, and to the MBNMS Vessel Traffic Working Group. The group has also worked to generate 20 support letters for the vessel traffic package from local and state groups. At its November 21st meeting in Monterey, NAVSAC unanimously approved the final report and recommended the Coast Guard pursue full implementation.

... Reauthorization - The draft language for the Reauthorization of the National Marine Sanctuaries Act is currently within the National Ocean Service (NOS). After it proceeds to NOAA and is signed off, the Advisory Council can comment.

... Measure F - Bill Douros wrote a <sup>3</sup>letter to the editor<sup>2</sup> of the Half Moon Bay Review and the San Jose Mercury News clarifying that the Sanctuary had not taken a position on San Mateo County's Measure F, the open space initiative.

... Bud Laurent - Bill Douros announced that San Luis Obispo County Supervisor Bud Laurent is stepping down. He has been a major supporter of the Sanctuary. Chet Forrest has drafted a certificate of appreciation.

Ed Brown made a motion to commend Bud Laurent by presenting him with a certificate of appreciation. Greg Cailliet seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

... Audubon Magazine - The magazine identified the establishment of MBNMS as one of the top ten environmental achievements in the past one hundred years.

Prior to breaking for lunch, Rachel Saunders presented Bill Douros with a soccer ball in recognition and appreciation for his one year as Superintendent of the Sanctuary. She passed the soccer ball around for Advisory Council members' signatures.

## VI. REPORT: OPERATION SEA DRAGON - AMPHIBIOUS LANDING

Bill Douros announced that the U.S. Navy and U.S. Marine Corps will be conducting urban assault simulations on the beach adjacent to the Navy Postgraduate School (NPS) and coordinated air assaults on the Defense Language Institute and (DLI) and NPS. Up to six Landing Craft, Air Cushioned (LCACs) will ferry troops and equipment ashore. LCACs will return the mock invasion force to ships offshore at the end of the day for a total of 12 individual round-trips performed during the exercise. Five large combat and combat support ships will operate beyond three nautical miles of shore. The training is tentatively scheduled for March 13, 1999.

Bill asked the Advisory Council to provide input on issues to communicate to the Navy and Marine Corps regarding Sanctuary concerns. The Sanctuary has already been working closely the Navy and Marine Corps to address potential issues such as waste discharges, marine mammal and bird disturbances, and noise. Advisory Council members suggested that public relations be closely monitored to assure people that the military is working in cooperation with the Sanctuary. Members also expressed concern that the event not be scheduled on the same day as the opening of the salmon sport fishing season, and that in the future the military be requested to remain consistent with the Coastal Zone Management Act.

## VI. REPORT: CONSTITUENT OUTREACH

Dorris Welch, Education representative, presented an update on the Sanctuary Education Panel (SEP) and her new position with the Oakland Museum of California. The SEP has a new Chair-Jeff Bryant from the Monterey Bay Aquarium, new members, and is developing a five-year educational plan.

The second annual Ocean Sciences Bowl has been scheduled for February 20 and volunteers are need to donate their time as officials and to donate in-kind awards in

sets of five or six. Monetary contributions to pay for trophies are also needed.

Dorris<sup>1</sup> new position at the Oakland Museum of California focuses on display design of California's natural history. One of her tasks is to bring in regional collaboration and thus, there is the potential to look at water quality issues.

## VII. DISCUSSION: SEA OTTER RELOCATION

Bill Douros directed the Advisory Council to Steve Shimek's letter requesting that the Advisory Council or Sanctuary office send a letter to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFW) expressing concerns about potential sea otter relocation efforts. Bill provided a very brief overview of the Sea Otter Translocation Program, a recent range expansion of the southern sea otter into the <sup>3</sup>no otter<sup>2</sup> zone created in 1986, and the decline in the otter population for the third consecutive year.

Bill stated that the Advisory Council could make one of three decisions: send a letter to USFW as requested by Mr. Shimek, put the issue on a later agenda for an in-depth briefing and discussion; or take no action at this time based on the information available to date.

Discussion ensued among Council members regarding the history of the Sea Otter Translocation Program and the issue as it relates to the Sanctuary.

The Advisory Council requested that the issue be placed on the February agenda for an in-depth presentation and discussion, focusing on how it relates to the Sanctuary.

## VIII. DISCUSSION: SUPPORT FOR GUADELUPE OIL FIELD MITIGATION PROJECTS

Bill Douros provided an overview the San Luis Obispo oil spill funds and the proposals the Sanctuary submitted for these funds. The Sanctuary office has requested \$750,000 to purchase a research and general patrol vessel; \$100,000 to assess the occurrence of oil and oiled wildlife along the central California coast from Ano Nuevo to Nipomo Dunes; and \$50,000 for educational signage at elephant seal haul-out sites at Piedras Blancas. Bill requested that the Advisory Council support the proposals by sending a drafted letter to the San Luis Obispo Regional Water Quality Control Board (RWQCB).

Discussion ensued among Council members regarding the expense of maintaining a boat and competitive proposals for the same pot of money. Greg Cailliet explained that the RAP sent a letter of support to the San Luis Obispo RWQCB regarding the Sanctuary's proposals because it made perfect sense for the RAP to support the Sanctuary despite the competition. Greg emphasized that by sending a letter of support, the Advisory Council would simply be advising that these proposals are good for the Sanctuary.

Rachel Saunders made a motion to send the draft letter with minor modifications (the proposal regarding the elephant seal outreach should emphasize that MBNMS will continue to work with Caltrans on existing projects) to the San Luis Obispo RWQCB in support of the Sanctuary's funding proposals. Greg Cailliet seconded and the motion passed, with abstentions from Lee Otter (California Coastal Commission) and Brian Baird (California Resources Agency) because they are State employees and would be commenting on State grant funds.

## IX. FUTURE AGENDA ITEM: FY98 SAC ANNUAL REPORT

Steve Webster requested that the Advisory Council submit comments on the draft FY98 SAC Annual Report to Lisa de Marignac no later than January 15, 1999.

## X. ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM COUNCIL MEMBERS

Marc Del Piero - requested that the issue of wetland loss in Elkhorn Slough be placed on a future Advisory Council agenda.

Greg Cailliet - a written update of the Research Activities Panel (RAP) was passed around during the meeting.

Richard Nutter - the Water Quality Protection Program (WQPP) agriculture plan is moving forward. The six farm bureaus are working together with the WQPP in these efforts.

Steve Scheiblaue - derelict vessels have been recently destroyed and photographs are available.

Doug Huckins - Scott Kathey, MBNMS, and CDFG officers took the inflatables up to San Francisco Bay and conducted educational stops along the way. Future patrols are being planned. Federal charges are being filed against the vessel responsible for October's oil spill. The Blue Fin is out of commission. Tim Loives, a new Monterey CDFG Lieutenant, might attend the next Advisory Council meeting.

Rachel Saunders - Rachel announced that she is taking a new position as planning director for Sea Camp Monterey Bay, and is currently working half-time for CMC and half-time for Sea Camp.

Ken Lundie - announced a surfing competition in Half Moon Bay.

Bill Douros - the Channel Islands NMS is holding their first Advisory Council meeting on December 11.

Brian Baird - the California Resources Agency will undergo dynamic changes in the upcoming year.

The meeting adjourned at 3:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa de Marignac,  
Advisory Council Coordinator

Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting - December 4, 1998      FINAL

